

2012

## Volume 37 Issue 2

Canada-United States Law Journal

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarlycommons.law.case.edu/cuslj>

 Part of the [Transnational Law Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Canada-United States Law Journal, *Volume 37 Issue 2*, 37 Can.-U.S. L.J. Iss. 2 (2012)

Available at: <https://scholarlycommons.law.case.edu/cuslj/vol37/iss2/18>

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Journals at Case Western Reserve University School of Law Scholarly Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Canada-United States Law Journal by an authorized administrator of Case Western Reserve University School of Law Scholarly Commons.

K  
3  
.A48  
c.1

Canada • United States  
LAW INSTITUTE



# Canada-United States Law Journal

## The New Perimeter Initiative: Will Security Trump Trade?

Edited by the Canada-United States Law  
Institute at Case Western Reserve University  
School of Law and The University of Western  
Ontario Faculty of Law

FOREWORD: BEYOND THE BORDER ACTION PLAN, A CONTEXT

*Dr. Emmanuel Brunet-Jailly*

KEYNOTE SPEAKER

*Ambassador David Jacobson*

THE NEW PERIMETER INITIATIVE: WILL SECURITY TRUMP TRADE?

THE TYRANNY OF THE "OR" AND THE GENIUS OF THE "AND"

*Hon. Kelly D. Johnston*

RESTORING RESPECT FOR THE LAW IN CANADA-U.S. COMMERCE:

THE REGULATORY COOPERATION COUNCIL SO FAR

*Christopher Sands*

PARTNERSHIP FOR REGIONAL PROSPERITY AND

GLOBAL PEACE

*Keynote Speaker: Ambassador John Negroponte*

Continued on Back Cover



Volume 37, No. 2 2012

JUN 21 2013



Canada·United States  
LAW INSTITUTE

# Canada- United States Law Journal

Volume 37, Issue 2  
Fall 2012



SCHOOL OF LAW

---

CASE WESTERN RESERVE  
UNIVERSITY

Western  Law

**Cite as:**  
**CAN.-U.S. L.J.**

The *Canada-United States Law Journal* (ISSN 0163-6391) is published by the Case Western Reserve University School of Law twice annually on behalf of the Canada-United States Law Institute. Annual subscription rates are \$66.00 per volume (\$68.00 foreign). Single issues are \$34.00 each (plus shipping & handling). Subscriptions are payable in advance. Subscriptions are renewed automatically unless timely notice of cancellation is received. Back volumes may be purchased by contacting William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14290 or online through HeinOnline at <http://www.heinonline.org>. The *Journal* is indexed in the *Index to Legal Periodicals* and is available on *Westlaw™* and *LEXIS™*. The *Journal's* policy requires that, unless a claim for non-receipt of a journal is received within three months after the mailing date, the *Journal* cannot be held responsible for supplying that issue without charge.

Address all correspondence and submissions to the *Canada-United States Law Journal*, 1075 East Boulevard, Cleveland, Ohio 44106.

In addition to articles and discussions compiled from the transcripts of the Canada-United States Law Institute's Annual Conference, the *Journal* also welcomes the submission of articles on topics in international and comparative law, especially those that relate to Canada-United States issues and relations. Submissions and manuscripts should be submitted in duplicate and should conform to the *Chicago Manual of Style* (16th ed.). Footnotes should conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (19th ed.). Unpublished manuscripts are the property of the *Journal* and cannot be returned to the author.

For all photocopy or republication requests, please contact Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. by mail: 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, by phone: (978) 646-2600, by fax: (978) 646-8600, by e-mail: [infoat@copyright.com](mailto:infoat@copyright.com), or online: <http://www.copyright.com>.

The opinions expressed are those of the respective authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the *Canada-United States Law Journal*, the Canada-United States Law Institute, Case Western Reserve University School of Law, or The University of Western Ontario Faculty of Law.

The *Journal* is printed by Darby Printing Company, 6215 Purdue Drive, Atlanta, Georgia 30336.

This issue went to press in March 2013.

UNITED STATES LAW  
JOURNAL  
2012-2013 Editorial Board

*Editor-in-Chief*

Jessica E. Rubin

*Managing Editor*

Tyler B. Talbert

*Publication Editor*

Stuart C. Sparker

*Articles Editor*

Kelsey Kaneshiro Marand

*Production Editor*

Katlyn Kraus

*Articles Review Committee*

Ruchi Asher

John D. Black

Steven J. Paille

*Canadian Managing Editor*

Scott D. Robinson

*Executive Editors*

Joseph M. Berndt  
John D. Black  
Avrohom J. Bulua  
Colin B. Campbell

Grant S. Dupont  
Amy M. Garrison  
Samantha C. Geaney  
Colleen M. Koehler

Mandy L. McNabb  
Jonathan C. Preece  
Thomas J. Puckett  
Geoffrey G. Taylor

*Associate Editors*

Ahad Ahmed  
Adam Asgarali  
Alyssa C. Dechow  
Faye Deng  
Samuel N. Dodoo  
Nathaniel Dreyfuss  
Liam J. Dunn

Joseph Kocian  
Sydney Kruth  
Megan J. Lem  
E. Richard Lowry  
Paul Migicovsky  
Michelle O. Murray  
K. Zoë O'Herin

Czarina Powell  
Frances R. Reinus  
Trace Sexton  
Jonathan A. Slomski  
Casandra M. Tice  
Julia A. Toso  
Emily J. Vassil

*Faculty Advisors*

Chios Carmody

Michael P. Scharf

David R. Kocan

*Academic Centers and Law Journals Assistant Director*

Nancy M. Pratt

*International Research Librarian*

Andrew Dorchak

# CANADA-UNITED STATES LAW INSTITUTE

Lawrence E. Mitchell

*Dean*

Case Western Reserve University  
School of Law

W. Iain Scott

*Dean*

The University of Western Ontario  
Faculty of Law

## ***United States Director***

Michael P. Scharf

*Professor of Law*

Case Western Reserve University  
School of Law

## ***Canadian Director***

Chios Carmody

*Professor of Law*

The University of Western Ontario  
Faculty of Law

## ***Managing Director***

David R. Kocan

Case Western Reserve University  
School of Law

## ***Academic Centers and Law Journals***

Nancy M. Pratt

*Assistant Director*

Case Western Reserve University  
School of Law

# Executive Committee and Advisory Board

## *Co-Chair*

James S. Peterson, P.C.  
Counsel  
Fasken Martineau  
Toronto, Ontario

## *Co-Chair*

Hon. James J. Blanchard  
Partner, Co-Chair,  
Government Affairs Practice  
Group  
DLA Piper LLP (US)  
Washington, D.C.

## Executive Committee

Stephen J. Petras Jr.  
Partner, International Team Leader  
Foster Hostetler LLP  
Cleveland, Ohio

R. Richard Newcomb  
Chair, International Trade Practice Group  
DLA Piper LLP (US)  
Washington, D.C.

Richard O. Cunningham  
Senior International Trade  
Partner  
Foster & Johnson LLP  
Washington, D.C.

Davis R. Robinson  
Senior Managing Director  
Brock Capital Group LLC  
Fmr. Legal Adviser to the  
United States  
Department of State  
Washington, D.C.

Lawrence L. Herman  
Counsel  
Fassels Brock & Blackwell LLP  
Toronto, ON

J. Michael Robinson, Q.C.  
Counsel  
Fasken Martineau DuMoulin LLP  
Toronto, ON  
Adjunct Faculty Member,  
The University of Western Ontario  
Faculty of Law,  
London, Ontario

Thomas M. Lussenburg  
Chair, Board of Directors  
Ontario Capital Growth Corporation  
Toronto, ON

James P. McIlroy  
Counsel on Public Policy  
McIlroy & McIlroy Inc.  
Toronto, ON

## Advisory Board

axter, The Honorable Randolph\*\*  
*United States Bankruptcy Judge*  
*United States Bankruptcy Court for the*  
*Northern District of Ohio Cleveland,*  
*Ohio*

oye, Timothy E.  
*Vice President and Chief Counsel-*  
*Competition and Trade Regulation*  
*ation Corporation*  
*Cleveland, Ohio*

ane, David  
*Indicated Columnist*  
*Toronto, Ontario*

unningham, Richard O.  
*Senior International Trade*  
*Partner*  
*Leptoe & Johnson LLP*  
*Washington, D.C.*

Boer, Stephen  
*Director General*  
*Environment Canada*  
*Climate Change International*  
*Montreal, Quebec*

urbin, Paul  
*Senior Counsel*  
*Miller Canfield*  
*New York, New York*

ordon, Richard  
*Professor of Law*  
*Case Western Reserve University*  
*School of Law*  
*Cleveland, Ohio*

raham, Hon. William C., P.C., Q.C.  
*Chancellor, Trinity College,*  
*University of Toronto*  
*Chair of the Atlantic Council of Canada*  
*Co-Vice Chair of the Canadian*

*International Council*  
*Toronto, Ontario*

Groetzinger, Jon  
*Visiting Professor of Law Director of*  
*China Legal Programs*  
*Case Western Reserve University*  
*School of Law*  
*Cleveland, Ohio*

Johnson, Jon R.  
*Solo Practitioner*  
*Toronto, Ontario*  
Kramer, Michael  
*Dickinson Wright PLLC*  
*Detroit, Michigan*

Laird, Ian A.  
*Special Legal Consultant*  
*Crowell & Moring*  
*Washington, D.C.*

LeCroy, Jessica  
*Senior Advisor*  
*Bennett Jones LLP*  
*Toronto, Ontario*

McCarney, Rosemary  
*President & CEO*  
*Plan International Canada*  
*Toronto, Ontario*

Meyer, Paul A.  
*Counsel*  
*Towers Watson*  
*Arlington, Virginia*

Petras, Stephen J., Jr.  
*Partner*  
*International Team Leader*  
*Baker & Hostetler LLP*  
*Cleveland, Ohio*



S. Richard II  
Counsel – International (retired)  
Corporation  
Pike, Ohio

Thomas A., Jr.  
President, General Counsel &  
Secretary  
Hannifin Corporation  
Cleveland, Ohio

Robinson, Davis R.  
Senior Managing Director  
Richard C. Breeden & Co. LLC  
Fmr. Legal Adviser to the  
United States  
Department of State  
Washington, D.C.

Sands, Christopher  
Senior Fellow  
Hudson Institute  
Washington, D.C.

Vernon, M. Catherine  
Vice President and General Counsel  
Formica Corporation  
Cincinnati, Ohio

Note: \*\*Indicates Honorary Advisory Board Member

## 2012-2013 Student Committee

### Executive Student Directors and Senior Research Fellows

Ida Anbarian  
Heather Lee  
Theodore Parran

Czarina Powell  
Hani Shamsi  
Jenna Ventresca

On behalf of the Canada-United States Law Institute, the *Journal* gratefully acknowledges support from the Government of Canada, and the Department of Foreign Affairs International Trade Canada. The *Journal* offers a special debt of gratitude for the ongoing support provided by the Consulate General of Canada in Detroit, Michigan, Consul General Roy Norton, and Political, Economic Relations, and Public Affairs Manager George Costaris.

## EDITOR-IN-CHIEF'S NOTE

Volume Thirty-Seven, Number Two of the *Canada-United States Law Journal* contains articles written by academics, professionals, and students regarding the Beyond the Border Initiative proposed by U.S. President Barack Obama and Canadian Prime Minister Stephen Harper on February 4, 2011. The *Journal's* umbrella organization, the *Canada-United States Law Institute*, held its annual conference on this initiative on March 22-23, 2012. The articles featured in this issue reflect the varying ideologies presented at the conference and related to this important endeavor. This issue showcases some of the brightest and influential minds in the field. The *Journal* extends a sincere thank you to the contributing authors for their insightful and exceptional scholarship and for their essential voice in this discourse.

This volume could not have been accomplished without the guidance and leadership exhibited by its faculty advisors. First, the *Journal* extends a warm thank you to its Case Western-based faculty advisor, David Kocan. David has been very supportive of the *Journal* and the new direction it has taken. His open-door policy and assistance throughout the process was key to this issue's successful publication. The *Journal* also wishes to thank Chios Carmody, whom albeit on sabbatical, provided continued support and enthusiasm to the University of Western Ontario Faculty of Law editorial staff.

We must also thank our editorial staff members for their hard work. The Executive and Associate Editors have worked diligently for months editing, finding strong supporting authorities, and footnoting. These are time-consuming, often frustrating, tasks and each editor has performed admirably. The *Journal* could not be published without the tireless work of these staff members.

Special thanks are also due to the Articles Editor, Kelsey Marand, and the Publication Editor, Stuart Sparker. Each went well beyond their "call of duty" and their help, humor, and contribution to this issue must be noted. Likewise, Scott Robinson, the Canadian Managing Editor, was invaluable at Western Ontario and successfully expanded the Western staff's involvement in the *Journal's* publications. Without Scott's hard work and dedication to the *Journal*, I doubt its bi-national nature could have continued.

Additionally, the *Journal* would like to acknowledge our research librarian, Andrew Dorchak. He is truly a research genius and our staff would be lost without him.

Lastly, and with my biggest thank you of all, I would like to recognize the Managing Editor, Tyler Talbert. Tyler has provided continued support throughout this entire process. His willingness to assume added duties despite his many other non-*Journal* related responsibilities is much appreciated. Tyler, thank you for not just being an awesome Managing Editor, but a great friend.

The *Journal* staff would also like to thank our family and friends for their support and patience during the publication process. We cannot imagine completing this issue without their encouragement and understanding.

On behalf of the entire *Canada-United States Law Journal*, we appreciate your continued support and readership. Thank you.

Jessica E. Rubin  
*Editor-in-Chief*



# Canada•United States LAW INSTITUTE

VOLUME 37, No. 2

2012

## THE NEW PERIMETER INITIATIVE: WILL SECURITY TRUMP TRADE?

FOREWARD: BEYOND THE BORDER ACTION PLAN, A CONTEXT

*Dr. Emmanuel Brunet-Jailly* ..... 273

### Welcoming Remarks

*Introduction: David Kocan* ..... 289

*Institute Representative: Hon. James Blanchard* ..... 290

*Keynote Speaker: Ambassador David Jacobson* ..... 292

*Final Remarks: Dean Laurence Mitchell and Dean Ian Scott* ..... 304

### Harmonizing the Border: Increase Jobs by Harmonizing Regulations

THE NEW PERIMETER INITIATIVE: WILL SECURITY TRUMP TRADE? THE  
TYRANNY OF THE "OR" AND THE GENIUS OF THE "AND"

*Hon. Kelly D. Johnston* ..... 309

RESTORING RESPECT FOR THE LAW IN CANADA-U.S. COMMERCE: THE  
REGULATORY COOPERATION COUNCIL SO FAR

*Christopher Sands* ..... 319

### Keynote Address

A PARTNERSHIP FOR REGIONAL PROSPERITY AND GLOBAL PEACE

*Introduction: Davis Robinson* ..... 341

*Keynote Speaker: Ambassador John Negroponte* ..... 342

### Trade and Jobs

TO GO FORWARD, WE MUST REMEMBER AND RELY UPON OUR PAST

*Paul Vandeventer* ..... 353

TRUST, IN SO MANY WORDS

*Birgit Matthiesen* ..... 365

TRADE AND JOBS: POLICY AND POLITICAL ISSUES

*Richard O. Cunningham* ..... 383

## Cyber Security and Infrastructure

THE INTERNATIONAL GOVERNANCE FRAMEWORK FOR CYBERSECURITY <i>Paul Rosenzweig</i> .....	405
BEYOND 'BEYOND THE BORDER': A PROPOSAL FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ACTION PLAN'S RECOMMENDATION ON CROSS-BORDER CRITICAL INFRASTRUCTURE <i>Michael C. McDaniel</i> .....	433
THE BEYOND THE BORDER ACTION PLAN: A TOOL FOR ENHANCED CANADA- U.S. COOPERATION ON CRITICAL INFRASTRUCTURE AND CYBER SECURITY, OR MORE WINDOW DRESSING? <i>William de Laat</i> .....	451

### Additional Commentary

BEYOND THE BORDER: A NEW CHAPTER IN NORTH AMERICAN TRADE <i>Rep. William L. Owens (NY-21), assisted by Legis. Asst. Adam Elias</i> .....	469
STRENGTHENING NORTH AMERICAN PERIMETER SECURITY: AN ANALYSIS OF UNITED STATES AND CANADIAN IMMIGRATION AND REFUGEE LAWS AND THE COLLABORATION REQUIRED TO HARMONIZE THOSE LAWS <i>Adam Centner</i> .....	493
BUILDING FENCES TOGETHER: THE EU'S LESSONS FOR THE U.S.-CANADA PERIMETER SECURITY PLAN <i>Matthew K. Grashoff</i> .....	517

### Closing Remarks

<i>Introduction: Chi Carmody</i> .....	551
<i>Keynote Speaker: Rear Admiral Michael Parks</i> .....	552
<i>Closing Remarks: Chi Carmody and Hon. James Peterson</i> .....	564

**Copyright © 2013 Canada-United States Law Journal**