

Case Western Reserve Journal of International Law

Volume 52 | Issue 1 Article 14

2020

Prosecuting Starvation Crimes in Yemen's Civil War

Laura Graham

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarlycommons.law.case.edu/jil



Part of the International Law Commons

Recommended Citation

Laura Graham, Prosecuting Starvation Crimes in Yemen's Civil War, 52 Case W. Res. J. Int'l L. 267 (2020) Available at: https://scholarlycommons.law.case.edu/jil/vol52/iss1/14

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Journals at Case Western Reserve University School of Law Scholarly Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Case Western Reserve Journal of International Law by an authorized administrator of Case Western Reserve University School of Law Scholarly Commons.

PROSECUTING STARVATION CRIMES IN YEMEN'S CIVIL WAR

Laura Graham¹

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| T_{AB} | LE OF CONTENTS | 267 |
|----------|--|-------|
| I. | PROSECUTING STARVATION CRIMES UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW | 269 |
| | A. Intentional Starvation of Civilians as a War Crime | . 270 |
| | 1. Geneva Conventions Additional Protocol I | .270 |
| | 2. The Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court Article 8 | |
| | | .272 |
| | B. Intentional Starvation of Civilians as a Crime Against Humanity (CAH) | . 273 |
| | 1. Geneva Conventions Additional Protocol II | .274 |
| | 2. The Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court Article 7 | |
| | | .275 |
| | a. Extermination | . 276 |
| | b. Other Inhumane Acts | . 277 |
| II. | EVIDENCE OF STARVATION CRIMES IN YEMEN | 278 |
| | A. Attacks on Civilian Objects and Destruction of OIS | . 278 |
| | 1. Ta'izz | |
| | 2. Tihama | .280 |
| | 3. The Red Sea Coast | .281 |
| | B. Blockades | . 281 |
| | 1. Hudaydah | |
| | C. Analysis | |
| III. | Conclusion | 285 |

The conflict in Yemen has created the world's worst current humanitarian disaster.² Due to the ongoing civil war that began in 2015 between Houthi rebels and the Yemeni government, widespread hunger and disease have left tens of thousands of innocent civilians dead.³ More than 20 million people are suffering from food insecurity

- 2. U.N. Secretary-General, Remarks by the Secretary-General to the Pledging Conference on Yemen (Apr. 1, 2018), https://www.unog.ch/unog/website/news_media.nsf/(httpNewsByYear_en)/27F6CCAD7178F3E9C1258264003311FA?OpenDocument [https://perma.cc/9F93-HU9K].
- 3. Samy Magdy, Aid Group: 85,000 Children may have Died of Hunger in Yemen, AP NEWS (Nov. 21, 2018),

^{1.} Laura Graham, Ph.D., is a J.D. candidate (2021) at Case Western Reserve University School of Law and Executive Director of the Yemen Accountability Project.

and preventable diseases such as cholera and severe malnutrition.⁴ Since 2017, an estimated 13 million Yemenis have been declared at risk of starvation⁵ by the United Nations, and Save the Children estimates that at least 85,000 children have died from starvation and starvation-related diseases.⁶ Nearly 100,000 deaths from conflict-related causes have been reported since 2015,⁷ though official reports of conflict-related deaths do not record starvation deaths.⁸ That is because starvation during conflicts is generally not considered a conflict-related fatality, but rather, an unfortunate consequence of war.⁹ Starvation is war crime only where belligerents employ tactics intended to bring about starvation of a civilian population as a military strategy.¹⁰

In Yemen, starvation deaths have been caused principally by three categories of events: (1) Economic crisis caused by the dismantling of

 $https://apnews.com/5f92d8bd6eba4286b4c07ae7c6d215f1 \\ [https://perma.cc/BAZ5-KZ37].$

- 4. Humanitarian Crisis in Yemen Remains the Worst in the World, Warns UN, UN NEWS (Feb. 14, 2019), https://news.un.org/en/story/2019/02/1032811 [https://perma.cc/2MG5-NHL6].
- 5. Yemen Could Be 'Worst Famine in 100 Years', BBC NEWS (Oct. 15, 2018), https://www.bbc.com/news/av/world-middle-east-45857729/yemen-could-be-worst-famine-in-100-years [https://perma.cc/C93E-DUHM].
- 6. Bethan McKernan, Yemen: Up to 85,000 Young Children Dead from Starvation, Guardian (Nov. 21, 2018), https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/nov/21/yemen-young-children-dead-starvation-disease-save-the-children [https://perma.cc/WRA5-YFEQ].
- 7. Press Release: Yemen War Death Toll Exceeds 90,000 According to New ACLED Data for 2015, ACLED (June 18, 2019), https://www.acleddata.com/2019/06/18/press-release-yemen-war-death-toll-exceeds-90000-according-to-new-acled-data-for-2015/[https://perma.cc/4GFF-CFZJ].
- 8. Samy Magdy, Database Says 91,600 Killed in Yemen Fighting Since 2015, ASSOCIATED PRESS (June 19, 2019), https://apnews.com/b28a2bdb1b01413689e05a7204e6ea90 [https://perma.cc/RA8X-BPPB].
- 9. Griffin Paul Jackson, Why It's So Hard to Prosecute Starvation as a War Crime, SLATE (Sept. 12, 2019), https://slate.com/news-and-politics/2019/09/starvation-war-crime-syria-yemen-icc.html [https://perma.cc/MP2U-VNNJ].
- 10. Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I) art. 54, June 8, 1977, 1125 U.N.T.S. 3 [hereinafter Protocol I]; Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts (Protocol II) art. 14, June 8, 1977, 1125 U.N.T.S. 609 [hereinafter Protocol II].

the Yemen Banking System, (2) Military attacks on agricultural and food production that destroy, deny or render useless objects indispensable to survival (OIS), and (3) Blockades of airports and seaports causing obstruction of humanitarian aid. The parties responsible for these atrocities include all of the major parties to the conflict: Houthi rebels, Yemeni government, and military, as well as the Saudi Arabia-led Coalition (SLC). This article will discuss whether the responsible parties for starvation in Yemen can be prosecuted under international criminal law (ICL) or international humanitarian law (IHL) for war crimes or crimes against humanity (CAH).

I. Prosecuting Starvation Crimes under International Law

While there are a variety of charges covering starvation crimes that could be brought under international criminal and humanitarian law, I focus my analysis in this article primarily on the crime of starvation. I begin this analysis by looking at the applicable law and then consider the evidence that would support prosecution.

Intentional starvation of civilians is a violation of IHL and ICL, as prohibited by the Geneva Conventions Additional Protocols I and II and the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court.¹³ Determining whether to charge perpetrators of starvation for committing war crimes or CAH depends on the following factors: (1) whether the targets of the attacks were civilians or combatants, (2) whether the starvation occurs during an international armed conflict (IAC), or (3) a non-international armed conflict (NIAC), and (4) whether the starvation was an isolated event or widespread or systematic.¹⁴ While Yemen has characteristics of an IAC insofar as the

^{11.} Martha Mundy, The Strategies of the Coalition in the Yemen War: Aerial Bombardment and Food War, World Peace Found, at 7, 11 (2018), https://sites.tufts.edu/wpf/files/2018/10/Strategies-of-Coalition-in-Yemen-War-Final-20181005-1.pdf [https://perma.cc/5NFA-FXE3].

^{12.} Michele Kelemen, U.N. Report Includes a Long List of Atrocities in The War in Yemen, NPR (Sept. 4, 2019), https://www.npr.org/2019/09/04/757394767/u-n-report-includes-a-long-list-of-atrocities-in-the-war-in-yemen [https://perma.cc/H4BC-QFPL].

^{13.} Protocol I, supra note 10, art. 54; Protocol II, supra note 10, art. 14.

^{14.} Compare Catriona Murdoch & Wayne Jordash QC, Clarifying the Contours of the Crime of Starvation, EJIL: Talk! (June 27, 2019), https://www.ejiltalk.org/clarifying-the-contours-of-the-crime-of-starvation/ [https://perma.cc/JJY5-U78U] (describing the elements of starvation as a war crime); with Junteng Zheng, Unlawful Blockades as Crimes Against Humanity, ASIL INSIGHTS (Apr. 20, 2018), https://www.asil.org/insights/volume/22/issue/5/unlawful-blockades-

belligerents to the conflict include the Yemeni government, Yemeni Republican Guard (YRG), Iran-backed Houthi rebels, and the Saudi Arabia-led coalition (SLC), the United Nations has not declared the war in Yemen as an IAC. ¹⁵ Therefore, this analysis will consider the possible charges of starvation occurring in both IACs and NIACs.

A. Intentional Starvation of Civilians as a War Crime

War crimes only occur during armed conflict against either civilians or combatants (or both). ¹⁶ Isolated attacks are sufficient to amount to a war crime. ¹⁷ To charge a perpetrator with a war crime, the *chapeau* elements must be satisfied – i.e. that the conduct took place in the context of and was associated with an IAC, and the perpetrator was aware of the existence of an armed conflict. ¹⁸ Intentional starvation of civilians is a violation of customary international law (CIL), IHL under the Geneva Conventions, and ICL under the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (ICC). ¹⁹ The legal frameworks prohibiting starvation are detailed below.

1. Geneva Conventions Additional Protocol I

Starvation of civilians as a method of warfare is prohibited under Article 54 of Additional Protocol I (API) of the Geneva Conventions:²⁰

Article 54 Protection of objects indispensable to the survival of the civilian population

- crimes-against-humanity (describing the elements of starvation as a crime against humanity).
- 15. See Non-International Armed Conflicts in Yemen, RULAC: Geneva Academy (May 14, 2019), http://www.rulac.org/browse/conflicts/non-international-armed-conflicts-in-yemen [https://perma.cc/F9AA-865Z].
- 16. War Crimes, UNITED NATIONS OFFICE ON GENOCIDE PREVENTION AND THE RESPONSIBILITY TO PROTECT, https://www.un.org/en/genocideprevention/war-crimes.shtml [https://perma.cc/NVA2-UUPU].
- 17. Joe Carter, The FAQs: What You Should Know About War Crimes, GOSPEL COALITION (Nov. 23, 2019), https://www.thegospelcoalition.org/article/faqs-know-war-crimes/ [https://perma.cc/2JSN-QVWC].
- 18. Elements of Crimes, INT'L CRIMINAL CT. (2001), at art. 8(2)(b)(xxv), https://www.icc-cpi.int/nr/rdonlyres/336923d8-a6ad-40ec-ad7b-45bf9de73d56/0/elementsofcrimeseng.pdf [https://perma.cc/8Z9T-A8P8] [hereinafter Elements of Crimes]; see also Murdoch & QC, supra note 14.
- 19. Protocol I, supra note 10, at art. 54; Protocol II, supra note 10, at art. 14; Beth Van Schaak, Siege Warfare and the Starvation of Civilians as a Weapon of War and War Crime, JUST SECUTIRY (Feb. 4, 2016), https://www.justsecurity.org/29157/siege-warfare-starvation-civilians-war-crime/ [https://perma.cc/MG79-DMYZ].
- 20. Protocol I, supra note 10, at art. 54.

- 1. Starvation of civilians as a method of warfare is prohibited.
- 2. It is prohibited to attack, destroy, remove or render useless objects indispensable to the survival of the civilian population, such as foodstuffs, agricultural areas for the production of foodstuffs, crops, livestock, drinking water installations and supplies and irrigation works, for the specific purpose of denying them for their sustenance value to the civilian population or to the adverse Party, whatever the motive, whether in order to starve out civilians, to cause them to move away, or for any other motive.
- 3. The prohibitions in paragraph 2 shall not apply to such of the objects covered by it as are used by an adverse Party:
- (a) as sustenance solely for the members of its armed forces; or
- (b) if not as sustenance, then in direct support of military action, provided, however, that in no event shall actions against these objects be taken which may be expected to leave the civilian population with such inadequate food or water as to cause its starvation or force its movement.²¹

Under Article 54 of API, there is a requirement that the starvation be deliberate: "To use it as a method of warfare would be to provoke it deliberately, causing the population to suffer hunger, particularly by depriving it of its sources of food or of supplies." "Methods of warfare" refers to the way that weapons are used in war; more specifically, methods of warfare refers to "(i) the way and manner in which the weapons are used; (ii) any specific, tactical or strategic, ways of conducting hostilities that are not particularly related to weapons and that are intended to overwhelm and weaken the adversary." API

^{21.} Id.

^{22.} Int'l. Comm. of the Red Cross, Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I), 8 June 1977: Commentary of 1987 Protection of Objects Indispensable to the Survival of the Civilian Population, Commentary 2089 (1987), https://ihl-databases.icrc.org/applic/ihl/ihl.nsf/1a13044f3bbb5b8ec12563fb0066f226 /6377cfd2c9d23f39c12563cd00434c81 [https://perma.cc/3ADZ-H2KT].

^{23.} Int'l Comm. of the Red Cross, Commentary of 1987 Basic Rules, Commentary 1402 (1987), https://ihl-databases.icrc.org/applic/ihl/ihl.nsf/Comment.xsp?action=openDocume nt&documentId=2F157A9C651F8B1DC12563CD0043256C [https://perma.cc/ER8J-YZZ3].

^{24.} Global Rights Compliance & the World Peace Found., The Crime of Starvation and Methods of Prosecution and Accountability, POLICY PAPER

applies to IACs,²⁵ and thus, violations of any of the provisions of Article 54 would amount to a war crime under IHL²⁶.

2. The Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court Article 8

Article 8(2)(b)(xxv) of the Rome Statute of the ICC criminalizes: "Intentionally using starvation as a method of warfare by depriving civilians of objects indispensable to their survival, including willfully impeding relief supplies as provided for under the Geneva Conventions."²⁷ There are four elements required to establish the offence of starvation:²⁸

Article 8 (2) (b) (xxv) War crime of star vation as a method of warfare

Elements

- 1. The perpetrator deprived civilians of objects indispensable to their survival.
- 2. The perpetrator intended to starve civilians as a method of warfare.
- 3. The conduct took place in the context of and was associated with an international armed conflict.
- 4. The perpetrator was aware of factual circumstances that established the existence of an armed conflict.

The first element concerns the *actus reus* or conduct taken by the perpetrator.²⁹ It is established by showing that the perpetrator deprived civilians of OIS and not by a showing of the result of starvation – i.e. that civilians died.³⁰ The second element establishes the *mens rea*

- 1, ACCOUNTABILITY FOR MASS STARVATION: TESTING THE LIMITS OF THE LAW., ¶ 75 (June 13, 2019) (citing G. Gaggioli and N. Melzer, 'Methods of Warfare' in B. Saul and D. Akande, Oxford Guide to International Humanitarian Law (forthcoming 2020)).
- 25. Protocol I, supra note 10, preamble.
- 26. Int'l. Committee of the Red Cross, Rule 53. Starvation as a Method of Warfare, IHL Database: Customary IHL (last visited Nov. 28, 2019), https://ihl-databases.icrc.org/customary-ihl/eng/docs/v1_rul_rule53#Fn_5496F01F_00004 [https://perma.cc/E4C9-GBYU] [hereinafter Starvation as a Method of Warfare].
- 27. Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court art. 8(2)(b)(xxv), July 17, 1998, 2187 U.N.T.S. 38544 [hereinafter Rome Statute].
- 28. Elements of Crimes, supra note 18, at Art. 8(2)(b)(xxv).
- 29. Id.
- 30. Global Rights Compliance & the World Peace Found., supra note 24, at $\P\P$ 47–48.

concerning the act of starvation.³¹ Elements one and two operate together, such that unintentional or negligent starvation will not be sufficient to prove that by depriving civilians of OIS, the perpetrator intended to starve civilians.³² Since there have been no prosecutions of starvation as a war crime under ICL, some scholarly interpretation of "intent" is necessary. Article 30(2) of the Rome Statute establishes that a person has intent where: "(a) In relation to conduct, that person means to engage in the conduct; (b) In relation to a consequence, that person means to cause that consequence or is aware that it will occur in the ordinary course of events."33 Starvation is a specific intent crime; in other words, the prosecutor must show that the perpetrator acted with an intent that went beyond the mere act of depriving OIS to include achieving the objective of starvation.³⁴ Unlike the specific intent crime of genocide, however, there is likely no need to establish proof of desire to starve civilians; it is enough to prove that the perpetrator knew or was aware that the consequence of deprivation of OIS would lead to the result of starvation, 35 thus lowering the requisite mens rea from knowledge to recklessness. The third and fourth elements concern the *chapeau* or contextual elements, which must always be present for a war crime to occur and are easily satisfied during IACs.³⁶ Finally, the Rome Statute only applies to situations and cases over which the ICC has jurisdiction.³⁷

B. Intentional Starvation of Civilians as a Crime Against Humanity (CAH)

Crimes against humanity (CAH) may occur during IACs or NIACs, but only against civilians.³⁸ CAH must be committed as part of a widespread or systematic attack upon a civilian population.³⁹ An attack is widespread if the attack is large scale in nature or number of

^{31.} Elements of Crimes, supra note 18, at Art. 8(2)(b)(xxv).

^{32.} See Global Rights Compliance & the World Peace Found., supra note 24, at $\P\P$ 45–46.

^{33.} Rome Statute, supra note 27, at art. 30(2).

^{34.} See Global Rights Compliance & the World Peace Found., supra note 24, at \P 45.

^{35.} See id. at ¶¶ 69–71.

^{36.} Elements of Crimes, supra note 18, at art. 8(2)(b)(xxv).

^{37.} Rome Statute, supra note 27, at art. 1.

^{38.} See Definitions: Crimes Against Humanity, UNITED NATIONS OFFICE ON GENOCIDE PREVENTION AND THE RESPONSIBILITY TO PROTECT, https://www.un.org/en/genocideprevention/crimes-against-humanity.shtml [https://perma.cc/9HLB-VSMN].

^{39.} Rome Statute, supra note 27, at art. 7(1).

victims. ⁴⁰ An attack is systematic if it is part of an organized plan or policy such that there is an improbability of their random occurrence. ⁴¹ As with the requisite $mens\ rea$ for war crimes, to charge a perpetrator with CAH, the chapeau elements must be satisfied. ⁴²

1. Geneva Conventions Additional Protocol II

Article 14 of the Additional Protocol II (APII) of the Geneva Conventions prohibits starvation of civilians as a method of combat during NIACs:⁴³

Article 14 Protection of objects indispensable to the survival of the civilian population

Starvation of civilians as a method of combat is prohibited. It is therefore prohibited to attack, destroy, remove or render useless, for that purpose, objects indispensable to the survival of the civilian population, such as foodstuffs, agricultural areas for the production of foodstuffs, crops, livestock, drinking water installations and supplies and irrigation works.⁴⁴

Article 14 is intended as a simplification of Article 54 of API, the purpose of which is to prohibit deliberately subjecting people to famine and to preserve the means of subsistence of the civilian population.⁴⁵ It is a codification of CIL prohibitions on starvation, for which no derogation is allowed.⁴⁶ Moreover, the exceptions allowed under Article 54(3)(a) do not exist in Article 14 of APII.⁴⁷ Finally, while sieges and blockades are considered legitimate methods of warfare, they must be

- 41. *Id*.
- 42. Elements of Crimes, *supra* note 18, at art. 7.
- 43. Protocol II, supra note 10, at art. 14.
- 44. Id.
- 45. Int'l Comm. of the Red Cross, Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts (Protocol II), 8 June 1977: Commentary of 1987 Protection of Objects Indispensable to the Survival of the Civilian Population, ¶¶ 4791–4792 (1987), https://ihl-databases.icrc.org/applic/ihl/ihl.nsf/Comment.xsp?action=openDocume nt&documentId=22A3363FA0482A57C12563CD0043AB5D [https://perma.cc/PYS3-CXN9].
- 46. *Id.* ¶ 4795.
- 47. Compare Protocol I, supra note 10, art. 54(3); with Protocol II, supra note 10, art. 14.

^{40.} Prosecutor v. Gotovina et al., Case No. IT-06-90-T, Judgment, ¶ 1703 (Int'l Crim. Trib. for the Former Yugoslavia Apr. 15, 2011).

directed at combatants 48 and the besieging party must allow the free passage of essential supplies and foodstuffs or allow civilian inhabitants of the besieged area to leave. 49 APII applies to NIACs, and thus, violations of any of the provisions of Article 14 would amount to a CAH under IHL. 50

2. The Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court Article 7

Article 7 of the Rome Statute enumerates CAH under the jurisdiction of the ICC.⁵¹ Despite the fact that the crime of starvation is enumerated as a war crime under Article 8 of the Rome Statute in IACs,⁵² no such similar provision exists under Article 7 concerning CAH.⁵³ While this might indicate that the drafters did not intend to allow prosecutions of starvation as a CAH or during NIACs, no such intent of the drafters of the Rome Statute has been recorded in the drafting history, leading some to argue that it was an oversight.⁵⁴ Indeed, this may be why Switzerland proposed an amendment to the Rome Statute in 2018 to include starvation as a war crime capable of being committed in a NIAC.⁵⁵ If adopted,⁵⁶ the amendment would have a significant impact on the ability of prosecutors to charge perpetrators of starvation in Yemen with war crimes, though only for future crimes of starvation, since the amendment would not apply *ex post facto*.⁵⁷

As an alternative to charging perpetrators of starvation with war crimes under Article 8, prosecutors could bring related charges of CAH under Article 7(1)(b) "Extermination" or Article 7(1)(k) "Other inhumane acts of a similar character intentionally causing great

- 48. Int'l Comm. of the Red Cross, supra note 45, \P 4796.
- 49. THE COMPANION TO INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW 647 (Dražan Djukić & Niccolò Pons, eds., 2018).
- 50. See Protocol II, supra note 10, preamble; Definitions: Crimes Against Humanity, supra note 38.
- 51. Rome Statute, supra note 27, at art. 7.
- 52. *Id.* at art. 8(2)(b)(xxv).
- 53. See id. at art. 7.
- 54. See, e.g., Mundy, supra note 11, at 3.
- 55. Id. See also Int'l Criminal Ct. Assembly of States Parties, Report of the Working Group on Amendments, ICC-ASP/17/35, at § II(A) (Nov. 29, 2018), https://asp.icc-cpi.int/iccdocs/asp_docs/ASP17/ICC-ASP-17-35-ENG.pdf [https://perma.cc/AC7W-JVV4].
- 56. The proposed amendment will be voted on in December 2019. See Rogier Bartels, Time to Fix the Rome Statute and Add the Crime of Starvation in Non-International Armed Conflicts!, EJIL: TALK! (Dec. 3, 2019), https://www.ejiltalk.org/time-to-fix-the-rome-statute-and-add-the-crime-of-starvation-in-non-international-armed-conflicts/ [https://perma.cc/ZNZ9-9YQR].
- 57. See id.

suffering, or serious injury to body or mental or physical harm."⁵⁸ CAH may be prosecuted in peacetime or armed conflict, and unlike the crime of genocide, CAH need not target a specific group.⁵⁹ Moreover, with CAH, there is no need for prosecutors to prove specific intent; simple intent to commit any of the listed acts under Article 7 is sufficient to charge perpetrators, so long as the *chapeau* elements are also met.⁶⁰ The relevant crimes relating to starvation of civilians under the Rome Statute are detailed below.

a. Extermination

Intentional starvation of civilians may be charged as extermination under the Rome Statute. Extermination includes "the intentional infliction of conditions of life, *inter alia* the deprivation of access to food and medicine, calculated to bring about the destruction of part of a population." Article 7(1)(b) of the Rome Statute criminalizes extermination as a CAH:

Article 7 (1) (b) Crime against humanity of extermination

Elements

- 1. The perpetrator killed one or more persons, including by inflicting conditions of life calculated to bring about the destruction of part of a population.
- 2. The conduct constituted, or took place as part of, a mass killing of members of a civilian population.
- 3. The conduct was committed as part of a widespread or systematic attack directed against a civilian population.
- 4. The perpetrator knew that the conduct was part of or intended the conduct to be part of a widespread or systematic attack directed against a civilian population.⁶²

With respect to the first element, the drafters note that the infliction of such conditions could include the deprivation of access to food and medicine. ⁶³ Additionally, the drafters note that "killed" is interchangeable with "caused death," ⁶⁴ either directly or indirectly. ⁶⁵ The *mens rea* for extermination is satisfied by a showing of intentional

^{58.} Rome Statute, *supra* note 27, art. 7(1)(b), 7(1)(k).

^{59.} Definitions: Crimes Against Humanity, supra note 38.

^{60.} Elements of Crimes, supra note 17, art. 7.

^{61.} *Id.* at art. 7(1)(b).

^{62.} *Id*.

^{63.} *Id.* at n.9.

^{64.} Id. at n.7.

^{65.} Id. at n.8.

killing or that the perpetrator recklessly caused the death of civilians. 66 With respect to the second element, some interpretation on mass killing is necessary to determine exactly what number of civilians must be killed to satisfy this element. 67 The third and fourth elements are the *chapeau* elements. 68

b. Other Inhumane Acts

Another way to bring charges against perpetrators of starvation falls under the residual category of CAH in Article 7(1)(k) of the Rome Statute. Article (1)(k) criminalizes such actions where:

Article 7 (1) (k) Crime against humanity of other inhumane acts

Elements

- 1. The perpetrator inflicted great suffering, or serious injury to body or to mental or physical health, by means of an inhumane act.
- 2. Such act was of a character similar to any other act referred to in article 7, paragraph 1, of the Statute.
- 3. The perpetrator was aware of the factual circumstances that established the character of the act.
- 4. The conduct was committed as part of a widespread or systematic attack directed against a civilian population.
- 5. The perpetrator knew that the conduct was part of or intended the conduct to be part of a widespread or systematic attack directed against a civilian population.⁶⁹

With respect to the first element, the prosecutor must establish a violation under Article 7(1)(k), the prosecutor must show that the perpetrator inflicted great suffering, or serious injury to body or to mental or physical health, by means of an inhumane act.⁷⁰ The International Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia (ICTY) ruled in the Krnojelac case that imposing a severe shortage of food can constitute infliction of great suffering, or serious injury to body or to mental or

^{66.} See David Marcus, Famine Crimes in International Law, 97 Am. J. Int'l L. 245, 273–274 (2003). See also Prosecutor v. Ignace Bagilishema, Case No. ICTR-95-1A-T, Judgment, ¶¶ 93–94 (June 7, 2001).

^{67.} See Marcus, supra note 65, at 273 n.240.

^{68.} See Elements of Crimes, supra note 17, art. 7(1)(b).

^{69.} *Id.* at art. 7(1)(k).

^{70.} *Id*.

physical health, by means of an inhumane act. 71 The remaining elements concern the *chapeau* elements. 72

II. EVIDENCE OF STARVATION CRIMES IN YEMEN

As noted above, starvation deaths in Yemen have been caused primarily by three factors: (1) Economic crisis caused by the dismantling of the Yemen Banking System, (2) Military attacks on agricultural and food production that destroy, deny or render useless objects indispensable to survival (OIS), and (3) Blockades of airports and seaports causing obstruction of humanitarian aid.⁷³ With respect to the economic crisis, although it has significantly contributed to food insecurity in Yemen, and some legal scholars have argued that it could be used as evidence in prosecuting starvation,⁷⁴ the likelihood of prosecutions based on that factor alone are tenuous, and thus I focus my analysis on attacks on OIS and blockades, as these events are most likely to lead to successful prosecutions of starvation crimes in Yemen.

A. Attacks on Civilian Objects and Destruction of OIS

One of the main contributors to starvation and related diseases in Yemen has been caused by the deliberate and disproportionate destruction of OIS.⁷⁵ According to the commentaries to the Geneva Conventions Additional Protocol II: "'Objects indispensable to the survival of the civilian population' means objects which are of basic importance for the population from the point of view of providing the means of existence."⁷⁶ Evidence of destruction of OIS in Yemen has been well documented by groups such as the World Peace Foundation, UNSC Panel of Experts on Yemen, Global Legal Action Network (GLAN), Yemen Data Project, Yemen's Ministry of Agriculture and Irrigation, and the Yemen Accountability Project.⁷⁷ Destruction of OIS include (1) attacks on critical infrastructure, such as electricity sources,

^{71.} Prosecutor v. Milorad Krnojelac, Case No. IT-97-25-T, Judgement, ¶¶ 179-183 (Int'l Crim. Trib. for the Former Yugoslavia Mar. 15, 2002).

^{72.} See Elements of Crimes, supra note 18, at art. 7(1)(k).

^{73.} See Accountability for Mass Starvation: Starvation in Yemen, Global Rights Compliance & World Peace Found. Policy Brief (Sept. 3, 2019).

^{74.} Martha Mundy, The Strategies of the Coalition in the Yemen War: Aerial Bombardment and Food War, World Peace Foundation Sidebar 11 (2018).

^{75.} See Accountability for Mass Starvation: Starvation in Yemen, supra note 73, at 1–2.

^{76.} Int'l Comm. of the Red Cross, supra note 45, \P 4803.

^{77.} Accountability for Mass Starvation: Starvation in Yemen, supra note 73, at 6.

water supplies, irrigation dams, agricultural extension facilities, as well as health facilities.⁷⁸ Indeed, the UN Human Rights Council reported that SLC airstrikes have caused significant damage to civilian objects leading to numerous civilian deaths.⁷⁹ This section examines the destruction of OIS in Ta'izz, Tihama, and the Red Sea Coast as some of the most egregious incidents of the war in Yemen causing starvation of civilians.

1. Ta'izz

As a consequence of being one of the primary battle scenes of the conflict between Houthi rebels and the SLC, Ta'izz governate suffered some of the worst death tolls of the war. 80 Beginning in 2014, civilian objects were repeatedly targeted, leading to the deaths and displacement of many civilians.81 Unlawful armed attacks were committed by Houthi rebels, SLC, Emirati forces, and Yemeni military forces.⁸² A variety of factors have worsened food insecurity in Ta'izz leading to starvation of civilians.⁸³ As a result of ongoing fighting, access to food in markets has been reduced significantly, and the price of food items has increased drastically, making food unaffordable for many.84 Additionally, SLC airstrikes targeting farms, markets, agricultural offices, and transportation centers has further increased food shortages.⁸⁵ As an example, in December 2017, SLC airstrikes targeted a market in al-Ta'izivah district, completely destroying the market and leaving 54 civilians dead and a further 32 injured. 86 Seventy five percent of the civilian population in Ta'izz in August 2018 were ranked as food insecure and at least 85 percent were dependent on humanitarian aid.87

- 82. Id. at 7.
- 83. Id.
- 84. Id.
- 85. Id.
- 86. Id.

^{78.} *Id.* at 1–2.

^{79.} Yemen: United Nations Experts Point to Possible War Crimes by Parties to the Conflict, U.N. Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner (Aug. 28, 2018), https://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?News ID=23479 [https://perma.cc/6H7E-LGJT].

^{80.} See id.

^{81.} Accountability for Mass Starvation: Starvation in Yemen, supra note 72, at 6–7.

^{87.} Accountability for Mass Starvation: Starvation in Yemen, supra note 72, at 6–7.

2. Tihama

In addition to the attacks in Ta'izz, other areas of the country, including fishing villages have been targeted.88 The period of March 2015 to August 2016 saw many airstrikes on agricultural targets.⁸⁹ Attacks on agricultural land is particularly egregious because only 5\% of Yemen's land is arable, and prior to the war, only 3\% of Yemen's total land surface was used for agriculture. 90 In Tihama, the attacks on OIS were not on fields or flocks, but on irrigation systems powered by oil-driven pumping.⁹¹ Beginning in 2011 and as a consequence of the war, oil shortages and price increases have made it near impossible for farmers to irrigate their land. 92 Since the late 1970s, the World Bank has invested in professionally engineered water diversion structures, overseen by the Tihama Development Authority (TDA), used to strengthen water disbursement to farm lands in the region.⁹³ However, twice in August 2015 and again in September, the SLC delivered a total of fifteen airstrikes on the TDA's central compound just outside Hudaydah, and a further three airstrikes attacked irrigation structures in wadi Siham in October 2015.94 The Yemen Data Project reports two additional attacks on TDA infrastructure in 2016 and another three in early 2017.95 As a consequence of these attacks, agricultural yields decreased by 42% among farmers in wadi Zabid and 46% in wadi Siham, due primarily to irrigation water shortages. 96 The Tihama region, once considered the breadbasket of Yemen, has decreased land cultivation by 51%, crop yields declined by 20-61% per hectare, there has been a complete annihilation of fruits, vegetables, and livestock population, as well as a population where 43% are food insecure. 97

- 88. Id. at 9.
- 89. Mundy, *supra* note 11, at 11–12.
- 90. Id. at 12.
- 91. Frank Steenbergen, Yemen's Irrigation System: Invisible Victim of the War, DOWN TO EARTH (May 3, 2017), https://www.downtoearth.org.in/blog/yemen-s-irrigation-system-invisible-victim-of-the-war-57759 [https://perma.cc/UX2W-V6F3].
- 92. Mundy, supra note 11, at 13.
- 93. Id. at 14.
- 94. *Id*.
- 95. *Id*.
- 96. Id. at 15.
- 97. Yemen's Burnt Granary, Flood-Based Livelihoods Network Found., http://spate-irrigation.org/yemens-burnt-granary/#more-6422 [https://perma.cc/69TU-X2NE].

3. The Red Sea Coast

Artisanal fishing has long been a primary source of food production in Yemen. 98 The General Authority of Fishing in the Red Sea has documented damages to fishing from the beginning of the war through December 2017. 99 The report shows that 146 fishermen have died due to Coalition airstrikes. 100 The report also reveals that 220 fishing boats were destroyed by SLC airstrikes. 101 Prior to the war in 2015, Yemen's fisheries sector ranked second in terms of exports and constituted 2% of Yemen's GDP. 102

B. Blockades

Another cause of starvation in Yemen is the unlawful obstruction and manipulation of humanitarian relief through blockades. Evidence of impeding humanitarian supplies and operations has been documented by the aforementioned groups. ¹⁰³ The evidence shows that blockades have halted delivery of humanitarian assistance, ¹⁰⁴ as well as causing unreasonable delays in the transport of humanitarian aid to areas affected by the famine. This section examines the blockade of Hudaydah, one of the most egregious incidents of the war in Yemen because of its effect on the worsening of starvation of civilians.

1. Hudaydah

Hudaydah was Yemen's poorest governate prior to the outbreak of war in 2015.¹⁰⁵ Sixty percent of Yemen's malnourished population resides in Hudaydah.¹⁰⁶ There are three major ports in the governate, two of which (Al-Hudaydah and Al-Saleef) receive the majority of

- 100. Id.
- 101. Id.
- 102. Ammar Al-Fareh, The Impact of the War in Yemen on Artisanal Fishing of the Red Sea, LSE MIDDLE EAST CENTRE REPORT, 7 (2018).
- 103. See Accountability for Mass Starvation: Starvation in Yemen, supra note 73, at 6.
- 104. Yemen: Coalition Blockade Imperils Civilians, Human Rights Watch (Dec. 7, 2017), https://www.hrw.org/news/2017/12/07/yemen-coalition-blockade-imperils-civilians [https://perma.cc/39ZV-U4R6].
- 105. Accountability for Mass Starvation: Starvation in Yemen, supra note 73, at 7
- 106. Id.

^{98.} See Accountability for Mass Starvation: Starvation in Yemen, supra note 73, at 3.

^{99.} Ammar Mohammed Al-Fareh, The IMPACT of the War in Yemen on Artisanal Fishing of the Red Sea 21 (LSE Middle East Centre Dec. 2018).

Yemen's food imports; the total number of commercial imports has declined significantly since 2014.¹⁰⁷ There are two other ports in Yemen at Aden and Al-Mukalla, but they lack the infrastructure necessary to receive bulk food shipments.¹⁰⁸ In April 2015, the SLC forces undertook a blockage of the Red Sea ports in order to inspect commercial ships that could be carrying prohibited weapons to the Houthis.¹⁰⁹ The consequence of the blockade, however, which lasted sixteen months, was to effectively limit the flow of food, fuel and medicine to civilians.¹¹⁰ On November 6, 2017, the SLC retaliated against the Houthi missile attack on Riyadh by imposing a sixteen-day total air, sea, and land blockade of Yemen, which blocked all food and fuel coming into the country.¹¹¹

C. Analysis

While there is ample evidence to show that the civilian population in Yemen is suffering from starvation and related diseases, prosecutors must determine what charges are appropriate under IHL and ICL. To amount to a war crime under Article 8 of the Rome Statute, perpetrators must intentionally use starvation as a method of warfare by depriving OIS. The language of the API of the Geneva Conventions is broader, stating that it is "prohibited" to attack, destroy, remove, or render useless OIS. That same language is reflected in APII for NIACs. The language is reflected in APII for NIACs.

Deliberate destruction of OIS, such as farms and fishing villages, is a war crime under API of the Geneva Conventions and Article 8 of the Rome Statute. Yemen, Saudi Arabia, UAE, France and the United Kingdom are all signatories to the 1977 Protocol I, while France and the United Kingdom are signatories to the Rome Statute. The attacks

- 107. Id.
- 108. Id. at 7-8.
- 109. Id. at 8.
- 110. Id.
- 111. Accountability for Mass Starvation: Starvation in Yemen, supra note 73, at 8.
- 112. Rome Statute, supra note 27, art. 8(2)(b)(xxv).
- 113. Protocol I, *supra* note 10, art. 54(2).
- 114. Protocol II, supra note 10, art. 14.
- 115. Protocol I, supra note 10, art. 54(2); Rome Statute, supra note 27, at art. 8(2)(b)(xxv).
- 116. Treaties, State Parties, and Commentaries, INT'L COMM. OF THE RED CROSS, https://ihl-databases.icrc.org/applic/ihl/ihl.nsf/States.xsp?xp_viewStates=Xpages _NORMStatesParties&xp_treatySelected=470 [https://perma.cc/8UDX-ULCK]; The State Parties to the Rome Statute,

on agricultural sites and equipment in Tihama, the destruction of fishing boats and skilled fishermen along the Red Sea coastline, and destruction of the food markets in Ta'izz are all demonstrative of the deliberate efforts of combatants to starve the civilian population into submission. In Indeed, as a number of sources have reported, a senior Saudi diplomat stated off-record, "Once we control them, we will feed them." This is probably the strongest proof of intent regarding the SLC's actions that could lead to charges of war crimes under Article 8(2)(b)(xxv). In Submission of the strongest proof of intent regarding the strongest proof of intent regarding the submission.

A key question that will need to be analyzed by prosecutors is whether the perpetrators of starvation knew or should have known that the sites that they were attacking were civilian targets, as well as whether they knew or should have known that the consequence of attacking those targets would lead to destruction of OIS and starvation of civilians. To this end, it is unlikely that American and British military advisors who gave target intelligence to the SLC in Tihama did not know the location and/or purpose of the TDA in providing critical irrigation infrastructure to farms in the region. 120 Likewise, the perpetrators of attacks on the food markets and fishing villages should have known that by targeting these sites, the civilian population would likely starve. The greatest challenge in this analysis is determining whether the starvation of civilians would have occurred but-for the attacks on OIS. In other words, given that Yemen was already on the brink of famine prior to the start of the war, are perpetrators of these attacks still culpable for causing civilian casualties? Moreover, are the deaths caused by diseases such as cholera and malnutrition too attenuated to be linked to attacks on OIS? How do we map the chain of causation and what if there is a break in the link of causation when multiple actors have targeted the same sites? What are the modes of responsibility for culplable actors? All of these questions need to be

^{117.} See Accountability for Mass Starvation: Starvation in Yemen, supra note 73, at 7–9.

^{118.} Mundy, supra note 11, at 7. See also Bin Salman Threatens to Target Women and Children in Yemen Despite International Criticism, MIDDLE EAST MONITOR (Aug. 27, 2018, 10:39 AM), https://www.middleeastmonitor.com/20180827-bin-salman-threatens-to-target-women-and-children-in-yemen-despite-international-criticism/ [https://perma.cc/CY96-XEG2].

^{119.} See Rome Statute, supra note 27, art. 8(2)(b)(xxv).

^{120.} Mundy, supra note 11, at 15.

addressed before charges can be brought against perpetrators of starvation.

Additionally, while the blockade of Hudaydah was effectuated for a legitimate military purpose (to stop the flow of prohibited weapons to the Houthis under UNSC Resolution 2216), 121 the blocking of essential items needed by the civilian population may constitute a war crime because under IHL, 122 blockades must allow for humanitarian aid to reach the civilian population. Inferring criminal intent in blockades is particularly challenging when a legitimate military purpose is Prosecutors must look to the overall lawfulness of the blockade to determine whether there was an intent to starve the population, and if so, whether and when it developed during the course of the blockade. Such evidence might include whether those in control of the blockade made good faith efforts to allow humanitarian aid to be delivered to civilians in timely a.

If prosecutors are unable to prove the requisite criminal intent to charge perpetrators with a war crime for starving civilians through OIS or blockades, they may bring charges of CAH under Article 7(1)(b) extermination or Article 7(1)(k) other inhumane $acts^{123}$. These provisions allow charges against perpetrators for killing or inflicting great suffering or serious bodily injury to civilians without the need to prove that the perpetrator intended the consequence to occur. ¹²⁴ The only requirements beyond the *chapeau* elements are that the perpetrator committed the act (destruction of OIS/blockade) and the consequence (starvation) occurred because of that act. ¹²⁵ Thus, bringing charges under Article 7 of the Rome Statute may offer a better solution to prosecuting perpetrators of starvation.

Finally, Yemen is not a state party to the Rome Statute, and the starvation crimes that have occurred in Yemen have not been committed by states party to the Rome Statute. Thus, the ICC

^{121.} S.C. Res. 2216, ¶ 14 (Apr. 14, 2015).

^{122.} Customary IHL - Practice Relating to Rule 54, INT'L COMM. OF THE RED CROSS, https://ihl-databases.icrc.org/customary-ihl/eng/docs/v2_rul_rule54 [https://perma.cc/EAR4-J3BN].

^{123.} See Junteng Zheng, Unlawful Blockades as Crimes Against Humanity, Am. Soc'y of Int'l L. (Apr. 20, 2018), https://www.asil.org/insights/volume/22/issue/5/unlawful-blockades-crimes-against-humanity [https://perma.cc/NS5E-ERR6]; Rome Statute, supra note 27, art. 7(1)(b) & art. 7(1)(k).

^{124.} Elements of Crimes, supra note 18, art. 7.

^{125.} See Zheng, supra note 123.

^{126.} U.N. High Comm'r for Human Rights, Situation of Human Rights in Yemen, Including Violations and Abuses Since September 2014, ¶ 17, U.N. Doc. A/HRC/39/43 (2018).

would only have jurisdiction over starvation crimes in Yemen if the UN Security Council referred the situation to the ICC under the principle of universal jurisdiction.¹²⁷ This is not impossible, as it is how the situations in Darfur and Libya were referred to the ICC.¹²⁸ However, the current political climate of the Security Council, combined with the fact that the members of the Security Council have assisted the SLC airstrikes in Yemen through arms sales,¹²⁹ a referral to the ICC seems unlikely any time in the near future. Yet, because starvation is prohibited under CIL and IHL, there are other courts that may bring charges against responsible parties.¹³⁰

III. CONCLUSION

I conclude with a discussion on what has to happen to enable accountability for starvation crimes in Yemen. First, there must be a cessation of hostilities. Historically, accountability processes do not begin until a negative peace or cessation of violence is garnered, usually through victory of one side over the other or a more likely for Yemen a negotiated peace agreement where combatants agree to lay down their weapons. Next, and likely part of that peace process, there will need to be a negotiation between parties as to establishing an accountability mechanism, or referring the matter to the ICC. Since the latter is unlikely, and perpetrators of war crimes rarely agree to processes which allow themselves to be prosecuted, the likely outcome for accountability in Yemen will depend on international diplomatic pressure to establish a criminal tribunal. In order to be seen as a legitimate arbiter of justice, any tribunal established for Yemen would need international-backing and must prosecute perpetrators from all sides of the conflict. The problem, of course, is that the political will to do this is lacking in the Security Council. As I previously discussed, several members of the Security Council may be implicated in war crimes and CAH in

^{127.} See In Hindsight: The Security Council and the International Criminal Court, Security Council Rep. (July 31, 2018), https://www.securitycouncilreport.org/monthly-forecast/2018-08/in_hindsight_the_security_council_and_the_international_crimin_al_court.php [https://perma.cc/3XST-92Z4].

^{128.} How the ICC Works, ABA-ICC PROJECT, https://how-the-icc-works.aba-icc.org/ [https://perma.cc/45WX-TCUK].

^{129.} Zoe Todd, U.S. Weapons, Saudi Airstrikes, Yemeni Deaths: What a U.N. Report on War Crimes in Yemen Means for U.S.-Saudi Weapon Sales, PBS (Oct. 1, 2019), https://www.pbs.org/wgbh/frontline/article/u-s-weapon-saudi-airstrikes-yemen/ [https://perma.cc/E4Y7-FYJK].

^{130.} See Global Rights Compliance & World Peace Found., The Crime of Starvation and Methods of Prosecution and Accountability, ¶ 128 (June 18, 2019), https://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/Legal%20Paper% 20Starvation.pdf [https://perma.cc/JJU3-Q8BS].

Yemen.¹³¹ Thus, there are significant obstacles to overcome with respect to finding the international political will for a criminal tribunal that investigates and prosecutes all parties to the conflict. Even if there were political will to do this, determining jurisdiction over the criminal acts and parties to the conflict is problematic without invoking universal jurisdiction, which is not impossible, but is unlikely. The longer the process of accountability takes, the more evidence is lost.

In the meantime, then, how can we ensure that evidence of war crimes and CAH are not lost? One approach that has been taken to ensure that evidence is not lost in Syria is the establishment of the International, Impartial and Independent Mechanism (IIIM) to Assist in the Investigation and Prosecution of Persons Responsible for the Most Serious Crimes under International Law Committed in the Syrian Arab Republic since March 2011. The IIIM was established by UN resolution 71/248 in December 2016 by the General Assembly. A similar mechanism could be established for Yemen, considering that the UN General Assembly has already condemned the violence in Yemen and urged members to take action to prevent worsening of the humanitarian disaster. Until such time as an investigative mechanism is established for Yemen, groups like the Yemen Accountability Project, the Yemen Data Project, the Global Legal Action Network, and others have committed to documenting evidence of war crimes and CAH to assist in future accountability processes in Yemen. ¹³⁴ Such efforts will provide valuable assistance to prosecutors seeking to charge perpetrators of starvation crimes in Yemen.

^{131.} See Todd, supra note 129.

^{132.} See Mandate, Int'l Impartial and Independent Mechanism, https://iiim.un.org/mandate/ [https://perma.cc/6TUE-JVF8].

^{133.} Id.

^{134.} Nathan Lesch, Yemen Accountability Project Aims to Document War Crimes, Observer (Mar. 1, 2019), https://observer.case.edu/yemen-accountability-project-aims-to-document-war-crimes/
[https://perma.cc/B55E-4QCN]; About, Yemen Data Project, https://yemendataproject.org/about.html [https://perma.cc/9BZL-SWQA]; Lauren L. Finch, How Global Legal Action Network is Documenting Digital Evidence of Airstrikes Against Civilians in Yemen, Huridocs (Nov. 12, 2019), https://www.huridocs.org/2019/11/glandocuments-airstrikes-in-yemen-with-uwazi-digital-evidence-vault-integration/ [https://perma.cc/JTX5-5EQK].