



SCHOOL OF LAW  
CASE WESTERN RESERVE  
UNIVERSITY

**Health Matrix: The Journal of Law-  
Medicine**

---

Volume 7 | Issue 1

---

1997

## Volume 7 Issue 1 (1997)

Case Western Reserve Health Matrix: Journal of Law-Medicine

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarlycommons.law.case.edu/healthmatrix>



Part of the [Health Law and Policy Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Case Western Reserve Health Matrix: Journal of Law-Medicine, *Volume 7 Issue 1 (1997)*, 7 Health Matrix Iss. 1 (1997)  
Available at: <https://scholarlycommons.law.case.edu/healthmatrix/vol7/iss1/2>

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Journals at Case Western Reserve University School of Law Scholarly Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Health Matrix: The Journal of Law-Medicine by an authorized administrator of Case Western Reserve University School of Law Scholarly Commons.



# HEALTH MATRIX:



## Journal of Law-Medicine

7:1 Office Copy

### SYMPOSIUM

#### WORKSHOP ON THE BRCA1 BREAST CANCER GENE IN THE JEWISH POPULATION

INTRODUCTION *Professor Maxwell Mehlman*

CLINICAL IMPLICATIONS OF BRCA1 GENETIC TESTING  
FOR ASHKENAZI-JEWISH WOMEN *Georgia L. Wiesner*

A PUBLIC HEALTH PERSPECTIVE ON THE CONTROL  
OF PREDICTIVE SCREENING  
FOR BREAST CANCER *George C. Cunningham*

DI GOLDINE MEDINA (THE GOLDEN LAND): HISTORICAL  
PERSPECTIVES OF EUGENICS AND THE EAST EUROPEAN  
(ASHKENAZI) JEWISH-AMERICAN  
COMMUNITY, 1880-1925 *Howard Markel*

JEWISH THEOLOGICAL AND MORAL REFLECTIONS  
ON GENETIC SCREENING: THE  
CASE OF BRCA1 *Elliot N. Dorff*

BREAST CANCER, THE GENETIC "QUICK FIX," AND  
THE JEWISH COMMUNITY *Karen H. Rothenberg*

THE TAY-SACHS DISEASE SCREENING PROGRAM IN THE  
U.S. AS A MODEL FOR THE CONTROL OF GENETIC  
DISEASE: AN HISTORICAL VIEW *Paul J. Edelson*

HOW ARE JEWISH WOMEN DIFFERENT FROM  
ALL OTHER WOMEN? *Nancy Press, Wylie Burke,  
& Sharon Durfy*

### ARTICLE

BRCA1: TO TEST OR NOT TO TEST, *Mendel E. Singer &  
Randall D. Cebul* THAT IS THE QUESTION

### NOTES

STOP GAGGING PHYSICIANS! *Jennifer D'Isidori*

THE CORPORATE PRACTICE OF MEDICINE:  
A CALL FOR ACTION *Sara D. Mars*

# HEALTH MATRIX: Journal of Law-Medicine



Volume 7

Winter 1997

Number 1

*Copyright by Health Matrix: Journal of Law-Medicine*

# HEALTH MATRIX: Journal of Law-Medicine

*Editor-in-Chief*  
Jennifer D'Isidori

*Managing Editor*  
Charles Pavelites

*Topic Development  
& Solicitation Editor*  
Kimberly Crawford

*Executive Articles Editor*  
Vasanth Shenai

*Executive Editors*  
Laurie Julius Avery  
Melissa Dosick  
Jason Garbell  
Kaz Kikkawa  
Jacob Manaster  
Sara Mars

*Senior Editors*  
Rachael Bralliar  
Corey Goldsand  
Colin Jennings  
Sharon Shapiro  
Cindy Worthing

Scott Augustine  
Denise Bradley  
Benjamin Bard  
Lauren Chung  
Amanda Gashel  
Todd Kleinman  
Chari-Lynn Koppel

*Associate Editors*  
Priya Krishnamoorthy  
Charles Mangum  
Mary B. Murphy  
Laura Nelms  
Melora Owen  
Deborah Pergament

Amy Pflug  
John Stam  
Traci Timko  
Donald N. Vangilder  
Jeremy Veillette  
Joan Wasylenki  
Rachel M. Weiser

Amanda Axtell  
Melinda Bechtold  
Jennifer Betinis  
David Bruce  
Sandy Buzney  
Brett Crockett  
Julie Dann  
Sal El Kasm  
Jon Feaver  
Alan Goldman  
Steven Gusky  
Amy Habinski  
Kate Harvie  
Meredith Haymes  
Shannon Hedrick  
Drew Hissong

*Staff Editors*  
Jenna Ingersoll  
George Ioannides  
Cristin J. Keenahan  
Lisa Kerr  
Melissa Kidd  
Fan-Su Ku  
Emma Dumley  
Kristi Lewis  
Carolina Marks  
Jeff Martin  
Ted D. Martin  
Matt Mennes  
Frank Miller  
Chris Nelson  
Jill Nelson

Kara Nichols  
Eric Norton  
Michele Norton  
Sameer Pandya  
Jason Parker  
Kiran Patel  
Sebastian Proels  
David C. Ryder  
Loretta Seasserra  
Aileen Serton  
Elizabeth Strawn  
Marijane Treacy  
Steve Trenta  
Mary Wall  
Lori Wolenski  
Isa Wolf

*Publisher*  
Amy B. Church

*Faculty Advisor*  
Maxwell J. Mehlman  
Director, Law-Medicine Center

*Coordinator of  
Student Publications*  
Carolyn L. Speaker

---

*Health Matrix: Journal of Law-Medicine*, formerly *Health Matrix: Quarterly Journal of Health Care Management* (ISSN: 0748-383X), is published by the students of Case Western Reserve University Law School.

Editorial and business offices are located at Case Western Reserve University School of Law, 11075 East Boulevard, Cleveland, Ohio 44106-7148, telephone (216) 368-2099. The submission of manuscripts is invited. The views expressed herein are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of *Health Matrix*, its editors and staff, or Case Western Reserve University School of Law. *Health Matrix* requests that contributing authors disclose any economic interests that may have influenced the positions they have taken in articles.

Subscriptions are entered for the entire volume for \$24.00 for foreign and domestic subscriptions. Any correspondence regarding subscriptions should be sent to the business manager.

Single issues are available for \$12.00 each. Back issues may be obtained from *Health Matrix*, when available. Back issues are also available in microform from University Microforms, Inc., 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106-1346, telephone (313) 761-4700. Selected *Health Matrix* articles are indexed in the National Reference Center for Bioethics Literature, Kennedy Institute of Ethics, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. Volume 3 and subsequent volumes are indexed in the Index to Legal Periodicals. Selected articles are also available on Lexis/Nexis, Westlaw, and PAIS.

*Health Matrix* conforms to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (16th ed. 1996), and the style conforms generally to *The Chicago Manual of Style* (14th ed. 1982).

Except as otherwise provided, *Health Matrix* grants permission for each article in this issue to be copied for use by nonprofit educational institutions, provided that 1) copies are distributed at or below cost, 2) the author and *Health Matrix* are notified, and 3) proper notice of copyright is affixed on the copies.

This issue went to press in February, 1997.

*Health Matrix: Journal of Law-Medicine* is grateful to the Law-Medicine Center at the Case Western Reserve University School of Law for its sponsorship of symposia and conferences concerning the latest developments in the area of law and medicine. During the more than forty years of operation, the Center has broadened its focus from issues involving forensic medicine to the whole range of legal, social, economic, scientific and ethical issues in which law and medicine are interrelated.

# HEALTH MATRIX: Journal of Law-Medicine

## SYMPOSIUM WORKSHOP ON THE BRCA1 BREAST CANCER GENE IN THE JEWISH POPULATION

### INTRODUCTION

*Maxwell J. Mehlman* ..... 1

### CLINICAL IMPLICATIONS OF BRCA1 GENETIC TESTING FOR ASHKENAZI-JEWISH WOMEN

*Georgia L. Wiesner, M.D.* ..... 3

### A PUBLIC HEALTH PERSPECTIVE ON THE CONTROL OF PREDICTIVE SCREENING FOR BREAST CANCER

*George C. Cunningham, M.D.* ..... 31

### DI GOLDINE MEDINA (THE GOLDEN LAND): HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES OF EUGENICS AND THE EAST EUROPEAN (ASHKENAZI) JEWISH-AMERICAN COMMUNITY, 1880-1925

*Howard Markel, M.D., Ph.D.* ..... 49

### JEWISH THEOLOGICAL AND MORAL REFLECTIONS ON GENETIC SCREENING: THE CASE OF BRCA1

*Elliot N. Dorff* ..... 65

### BREAST CANCER, THE GENETIC "QUICK FIX," AND THE JEWISH COMMUNITY

*Karen H. Rothenberg* ..... 97

### THE TAY-SACHS DISEASE SCREENING PROGRAM IN THE U.S. AS A MODEL FOR THE CONTROL OF GENETIC DISEASE: AN HISTORICAL VIEW

*Paul J. Edelson, M.D.* ..... 125

### HOW ARE JEWISH WOMEN DIFFERENT FROM ALL OTHER WOMEN?

*Nancy Press, Ph. D., Wylie Burke, M.D., Ph.D.,  
and Sharon Durfy, Ph.D.* ..... 135

ARTICLE

BRCA1: TO TEST OR NOT TO TEST,  
THAT IS THE QUESTION  
*Mendel E. Singer, Ph.D. and  
Randall D. Cebul, M.D.*..... 163

NOTES

STOP GAGGING PHYSICIANS!  
*Jennifer L. D'Isidori*..... 187

THE CORPORATE PRACTICE OF MEDICINE:  
A CALL FOR ACTION  
*Sara D. Mars* ..... 241