2009

Book Review of Transnational Civil Society: An Introduction and Contested Citizenship: Immigration and Cultural Diversity in Europe

Ghoshal

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarlycommons.law.case.edu/swb

Part of the Human Rights Law Commons, and the Social and Behavioral Sciences Commons

Recommended Citation


This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Cross Disciplinary Publications at Case Western Reserve University School of Law Scholarly Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Societies Without Borders by an authorized administrator of Case Western Reserve University School of Law Scholarly Commons.
Crossing Borders: States, Migration, and Transnational Civil Society

*Transnational Civil Society: An Introduction.* By Srilatha Batliwala and L. David Brown (eds.). (Bloomfield, CT: Kumarian Press, 2006. 270 pp. hardcover $55.00; softcover $25.95.)

*Contested Citizenship: Immigration and Cultural Diversity in Europe.* By Ruud Koopmans, Paul Statham, Marco Giungi, and Florence Passy. (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2005. 376 pp. hardcover $75.00; softcover $25.00.)

Reviewer: Raj Ghoshal, Sociology Department, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, USA

Srilatha Batliwala and L. David Brown’s *Transnational Civil Society: An Introduction* aims to introduce readers to some of the key orienting concepts and movements in the field of transnational civil society (hereafter TCS). Following an introductory chapter by the editors on “Why Civil Society Matters,” the book is divided into two parts. “Transnationalism and Global Power” lays the theoretical foundations for the study of TCS, exploring the changes in world order over the past four decades that have provided the impetus for the growth of transnational movements. “ Movements that Changed the World” examines the labor movement, transnational environmentalism, economic justice movements, the women’s movement, human rights, and peace activism. The book concludes with the editors’ assessment of TCS’s prospects for influence throughout the remainder of the century.

The most interesting part of the book is its second section, which covers transnational campaigns and movements. These chapters are mainly historical, but many include assessments of current challenges confronting TCS organizations, such as efforts by national governments and journalists to cast TCS organizations as unelected outsiders with no legitimacy to make claims in domestic politics. I found John Clark’s chapter on global economic justice movements the most engaging. He aptly and colorfully characterizes “antiglobalization” protests as “a protest mall comprising hundreds of specific causes with just a vague unifying theme” (p. 130) and ties this to the looseness of the internet-based networks that give rise to them. His analysis is thoughtful, but at times derailed by unsupported statements; for example, he incorrectly claims that both the United States...
and United Kingdom had voter turnout of 80 percent until the last few years. He cites protestor violence during Seattle’s 1999 protest as a source of movement strength, rather than considering either the extent to which forces resistant to the movement have exploited caricatures of violent anarchists in justifying repression or the extent to which police rather than protesters may have initiated violence.

A strength of the book is its largely successful effort to bridge academic and practitioner perspectives. Occasionally, however, the authors emphasize anecdote over evidence in ways that weaken the case they would like to make. It would be easy for a beginning student to read this volume and assume that TCS organizations are both immensely powerful and nearly always “good.”

Throughout the second section, the book includes case studies of particular campaigns and issues. Some of the cases featured here are the campaign against South African apartheid, mobilization against female genital mutilation, and the International Campaign to Ban Landmines. They provide a summary of key transnational campaigns that will be of use to new readers in this field. The book also contains a useful list of international human rights treaties.

Those who would like to explore one particular issue – migration – in which we might expect transnational organizations to play a key role would do well to turn to Koopmans, Statham, Giungi, and Passy’s Contested Citizenship: Immigration and Cultural Diversity in Europe. Drawing on a decade’s worth of work studying Switzerland, Germany, France, the Netherlands, and Britain, the authors inquire into variation in political claim-making in the context of migration issues.

The book begins with a crisp theoretical overview of migration politics in Europe. Identifying two continua of conceptions of citizenship, the authors provide the foundation for the rest of their work. One continuum concerns “equality of individual access to citizenship,” which ranges from “ethnic” (citizenship is restricted to the ethnically native) to “civic-territorial” (in which those who reside in a country are extended citizenship rights). The other continuum, “cultural difference and group rights,” runs from “cultural monism” (policy encourages migrants to adopt host nation cultural practices) to “cultural pluralism” (migrants are encouraged to retain a distinctive group identity). The resulting two-dimensional space yields four ideal-type configurations of citizenship regimes: assimilationist, segregationist, universalist, and multiculturalist (p. 10).

In the next chapter, the authors assess whether migration politics support the “postnational thesis” that states are becoming less relevant as
transnational organizations become more important decision-makers. The data they present shows that states are treated by all claims-makers as the most important actors, and reveals that transnational institutions are often geared toward limiting migrants’ rights rather than expanding them.

Chapter Three closely examines the claims-making of migrants, and the authors find strong support for their thesis that citizenship regimes matter greatly. Chapter Four focuses on Muslims in particular, and finds that “group demands” for cultural accommodation vary greatly by citizenship regime. Chapters Five and Six concern anti-migrant and pro-migrant activism. The authors find that the varied state constructions of citizenship in the five countries, more than immigrant characteristics or native countries’ economic conditions, are critical in explaining the divergent experiences of immigrants.

The final chapter summarizes the findings, and then argues that states that make citizenship accessible to migrants are likely to see reduced political conflict among migrants and between migrants and natives. While not all readers will agree with the conclusions, the authors engage debates about multiculturalism with a well-argued and nuanced discussion of the benefits and drawbacks of according distinctive group rights.

Like all studies, this book is not without flaws. The authors draw from social movement studies’ political opportunity theories to ground the use of the concept of “discursive opportunity structure,” but sidestep debates over the testability of such opportunity structures. Further, the distinction they make between the separate fields of immigrant politics, integration politics, and the politics of racism and xenophobia is under-explained. However, these are small flaws in an otherwise excellent book that is both encyclopedic and theoretically incisive.

While the two books appear to come down on opposite sides with regard to the power of transnational organizations, both make solid contributions. Transnational Civil Society will be of use to those readers who seek an accessible orientation to a growing field of scholarship. And Contested Citizenship is an outstanding contribution to studies of migration, citizenship, transnationalism, Europeanization, and social movements.